

Rhetoric

An Historical Introduction

Wendy Olmsted



Rhetoric

To
my family
Bill, Willie, Jennifer, and Nicholas
in gratitude for their love and conversation
throughout the years

Rhetoric

An Historical Introduction

Wendy Olmsted



© 2006 by Wendy Olmsted

BLACKWELL PUBLISHING
350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, UK
550 Swanston Street, Carlton, Victoria 3053, Australia

The right of Wendy Olmsted to be identified as the Author of this Work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs, and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs, and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

First published 2006 by Blackwell Publishing Ltd

1 2006

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Olmsted, Wendy, 1943–
Rhetoric : an historical introduction / Wendy Olmsted.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-1-4051-1772-2 (hardcover: alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 1-4051-1772-9 (hardcover: alk. paper)

ISBN-13: 978-1-4051-1773-9 (pbk.: alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 1-4051-1773-7 (pbk.: alk. paper) 1. Rhetoric—History. I. Title.

PN183.O46 2007
808—dc22

2005026435

A catalogue record for this title is available from the British Library.

Set in 10/12.5pt DanteMT
by SPI Publisher Services, Pondicherry, India
Printed and bound in Singapore
by COS Printers Pte Ltd

The publisher's policy is to use permanent paper from mills that operate a sustainable forestry policy, and which has been manufactured from pulp processed using acid-free and elementary chlorine-free practices. Furthermore, the publisher ensures that the text paper and cover board used have met acceptable environmental accreditation standards.

For further information on
Blackwell Publishing, visit our website:
www.blackwellpublishing.com

Contents

Acknowledgments	vii
List of Abbreviations	viii
Introducing Rhetoric	1
Part I: Classical Rhetorical Traditions	5
Introduction	7
1 The Rhetorician: Demagogue or Statesman? Plato's <i>Gorgias</i> and Aristotle's <i>Rhetoric</i>	10
2 Eloquence, Persuasion, and Invention: Cicero's <i>De oratore</i>	25
3 Rhetoric and the Search for God: Augustine's <i>On Christian Doctrine</i> and <i>Confessions</i>	34
4 Practical Reason or Interested Calculation? Cicero's <i>On Duties</i> and Machiavelli's <i>The Prince</i>	48
Part II: Classical Rhetoric and Literary Interpretation	63
Introduction	65
5 Tradition and Invention: Bacon's Aphorisms and the <i>Essays</i>	67
6 Deception, Strong Speech, and Mild Discourse in Milton's Early Prose and <i>Paradise Lost</i>	83
7 Prudence and Eloquence in Jane Austen's <i>Persuasion</i>	96

Part III: Rhetoric and Contemporary Disciplines	111
Introduction	113
8 Literary Criticism and Rhetorical Invention: Wayne C. Booth's <i>The Rhetoric of Fiction</i> and Stephen Greenblatt's <i>Marvelous Possessions</i>	116
9 Faction, Politics, and Rhetorical Invention: Eugene Garver's <i>For the Sake of Argument</i> and Danielle S. Allen's <i>Talking to Strangers</i>	127
10 Legal Reasoning, Historical Contingency, and Change: Edward H. Levi's <i>An Introduction to Legal Reasoning</i>	138
Index	153

Acknowledgments

This book is the fruit of many years of teaching and of conversations with colleagues, students, friends, and family. In articulating my project, I have benefited from the advice of Wayne C. Booth, Eugene Garver, and Walter Jost, and from their astute readings of chapters. I am grateful to Janel Mueller, Michael Murrin, Joshua Scodel, and Richard Strier for their perceptive and learned comments on a draft of the Francis Bacon chapter presented to the Renaissance Workshop at the University of Chicago. (Naturally, I remain responsible for my errors.) The students and faculty members of the Renaissance Workshop, Ancient Societies Workshop, and Rhetoric and Poetry Workshop at the University of Chicago have consistently refined and informed my thinking and have been a source of collegiality and scholarly conversation. Dennis Hutchinson graciously provided references and stimulating conversation. Andrew McNeillie, the editor at Blackwell who commissioned this volume, stimulated my ideas and provided wonderful enthusiasm. I benefited from helpful, broad-ranging anonymous readers' reports, and Blackwell Publishing kindly gave me permission to reprint most of Chapter 11, "Exemplifying deliberation: Cicero's *De officiis* and Machiavelli's *Prince*," from *A Companion to Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism* (2004), pp. 173–89. Professors John Boyer, Dean of the College, and Dennis Hutchinson, Master of the New Collegiate Division, at the University of Chicago have been unfailing sources of support and encouragement as well as granting a course reduction so that I could finish the book. My husband Bill has been a faithful and discerning reader of drafts. My last and greatest debt is to him for his constant love, patience, and intelligence and to Jennifer and Nicholas for their affection, liveliness, and stimulating conversation.

Abbreviations

Primary Works

- Analytica priora* Aristotle, *Analytica priora*, in *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, ed. Richard McKeon (New York: Random House, 1941).
- The “Art” of Rhetoric* Aristotle, *The “Art” of Rhetoric*, trans. John Henry Freese (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1975).
- CD Augustine, *On Christian Doctrine*, trans. and with introduction by D. W. Robertson (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, Library of Liberal Arts, 1958).
- Characteristicks* Anthony Ashley Cooper, 3rd Earl of Shaftesbury, *Characteristicks of Men, Manner, Opinions, Times*, ed. Philip Ayers (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999), vol. I.
- Confessions* *St Augustine’s Confessions*, 2 vols., trans. William Watts (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1977).
- CPW *Complete Prose Works of John Milton*, 8 vols., general editor Don M. Wolfe (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1953–82).
- De amicitia* Cicero, *De senectute, De amicitia, De divinatione*, trans. William Armistead Falconer (London: William Heinemann, 1923), pp. 109–211.

- A Defence of Poetry* Sir Philip Sidney, *A Defence of Poetry*, in *Miscellaneous Prose of Sir Philip Sidney*, ed. Katherine Duncan-Jones and Jan van Dorsten (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1973), pp. 73–121.
- De inventione* Cicero, *De inventione*, trans. H. M. Hubbell (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1968).
- De officiis* Cicero, *De officiis*, trans. Walter Miller (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1913, repr. 1997).
- De oratore* Cicero, *De oratore*, trans. E. W. Sutton and H. Rackham (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1959).
- Essays* Francis Bacon, *The Essays*, ed. and with introduction by John Pitcher (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1985).
- “Flatterer” Plutarch, “How to distinguish a flatterer from a friend,” in *Essays*, trans. Robin Waterfield (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1992), pp. 61–112.
- For the Sake of Argument* Eugene Garver, *For the Sake of Argument: Practical Reasoning, Character, and the Ethics of Belief* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004).
- Francis Bacon* Francis Bacon, ed. Brian Vickers (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996).
- Gorgias* Plato, *Gorgias*, trans. Donald J. Zeyl (Indianapolis and Cambridge: Hackett Publishing, 1987).
- “Human nature” Thomas Hobbes, “Human nature,” in *The English Works of Thomas Hobbes*, ed. Sir William Molesworth (London: John Bohn, 1840; repr. Germany: Scientia Verlag Aalen, 1966), chapter VIII, para. 8, p. 40.
- Lectures on Rhetoric* Hugh Blair, *Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Lettres* (1819), introduction by Charlotte Downey (Delmar, NY: Scholars’ Facsimiles & Reprints, 1993).
- Legal Reasoning* Edward H. Levi, *An Introduction to Legal Reasoning* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1949).
- Life and Letters* Francis Bacon, *The Life and Letters of Francis Bacon*, 7 vols., ed. James Spedding (London: Longman, Green, Longman, and Roberts, 1861–74).

x List of Abbreviations

- Mandeville's Travels* *Mandeville's Travels: Texts and Translations*, ed. Malcolm Letts, Works issued by the Hakluyt Society, 2nd series, 101–2 (London: Hakluyt Society, 1953).
- Marvelous Possessions* Stephen Greenblatt, *Marvelous Possessions: the Wonder of the New World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991).
- Nicomachean Ethics* Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, trans. Martin Ostwald (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, Library of Liberal Arts, 1999).
- Novum organum* Francis Bacon, *Novum organum with Other Parts of the Great Instauration*, trans. and ed. with introduction and notes by Peter Urbach and John Gibson (Chicago: Open Court, 1994).
- “Of cannibals” M. E. de Montaigne, *The Complete Essays of Montaigne*, trans. Donald Frame (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1957), pp. 150–9.
- “Of the custom” M. E. de Montaigne, *The Complete Essays of Montaigne*, trans. Donald Frame (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1957).
- On Duties* Cicero, *On Duties*, trans. M. T. Griffin and E. M. Adkins (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991, repr. 1993).
- On Rhetoric* Aristotle, *On Rhetoric: a Theory of Civic Discourse*, trans. George A. Kennedy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991).
- Orator* Cicero, *Orator*, in *Brutus; Orator*, trans. G. L. Hendrickson and H. M. Hubbell (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1971), pp. 306–538.
- Peloponnesian War* Thucydides, *The Peloponnesian War*, trans. Rex Warner (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1972).
- Persuasion* Jane Austen, *Persuasion*, with introduction and notes by Gillian Beer (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1998, repr. 2003).

- PL* John Milton, *Paradise Lost*, in *John Milton: Complete Poems and Major Prose*, ed. Merritt Y. Hughes (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1957), pp. 173–470.
- Politics* Aristotle, *Politics*, trans. H. Rackham (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1990).
- The Prince* Niccolò Machiavelli, *The Prince*, 2nd edn., trans. and ed. with introduction and notes by Robert M. Adams (New York: W. W. Norton, 1992).
- “Resonance” Stephen J. Greenblatt, “Resonance and wonder,” in *Learning to Curse* (New York: Routledge, 1990), pp. 161–83.
- Rhetoric* Aristotle, *Rhetoric*, trans. W. R. Roberts (New York: Modern Library, 1954).
- Rhetoric of Fiction* Wayne C. Booth, *The Rhetoric of Fiction* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961, 2nd edn. 1983).
- Select Documents* *Select Documents Illustrating the Four Voyages of Columbus*, 2 vols., trans. and ed. Cecil Jane (London: Hakluyt Society, 1930).
- Talking to Strangers* Danielle S. Allen, *Talking to Strangers: Anxieties of Citizenship since Brown v. Board of Education* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004).
- Topica* Cicero, *Topica*, in *De inventione, De optimo genere oratorum, Topica*, trans. H. M. Hubbell (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1968), pp. 383–459.
- Works* Francis Bacon, *The Works of Francis Bacon*, 7 vols., ed. James Spedding, Robert L. Ellis, and Douglas D. Heath (London: 1857–74; facsimile repr. Stuttgart: Friedrich Frommann Verlag, 1963).

Secondary References

- Achilles in Vietnam* Jonathan Shay, *Achilles in Vietnam: Combat Trauma and the Undoing of Character* (New York: Atheneum, 1994).
- Analogical Imagination* David Tracy, *The Analogical Imagination: Christian Theology and the Culture of Pluralism* (New York: Crossroad, 1981).

xii List of Abbreviations

- Aristotle's Rhetoric* Eugene Garver, *Aristotle's Rhetoric: an Art of Character* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).
- "Articles of faith" Michael Ignatieff, "Articles of faith," *Index on Censorship* 5 (1996), pp. 110–22.
- "Bacon and rhetoric" Brian Vickers, "Bacon and rhetoric," in *The Cambridge Companion to Bacon*, ed. Markku Peltonen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), pp. 200–31.
- Bacon on Communication* Karl L. Wallace, *Francis Bacon on Communication and Rhetoric* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1943).
- "Bacon's Essays" Ronald S. Crane, "The relation of Bacon's *Essays* to his program for the advancement of learning," in *Essential Articles for the Study of Francis Bacon*, ed. Brian Vickers (Hamden, Conn.: Archon Books, 1968), pp. 272–92.
- Between Friends* John. M. Najemy, *Between Friends: Discourses of Power and Desire in the Machiavelli–Vettori Letters of 1513–1515* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1995).
- "Charity" David Tracy, "Charity, obscurity, clarity: Augustine's search for rhetoric and hermeneutics," in *Rhetoric and Hermeneutics in Our Time: a Reader*, ed. Walter Jost and Michael J. Hyde (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1997), pp. 254–74.
- "Cicero's *De officiis*" Marcia. L. Colish, "Cicero's *De officiis* and Machiavelli's *Prince*," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 9/1 (1978), pp. 81–93.
- "Civic hero" Annabel Patterson, "The civic hero in Milton's prose," *Milton Studies* 8 (1975), pp. 71–101.
- Companion to Rhetoric* *A Companion to Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism*, ed. Walter Jost and Wendy Olmsted (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004).
- "Contingency" Dilip Parmeshwar Gaonkar, "Contingency and probability," in *A Companion to Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism*, ed. Walter Jost and Wendy Olmsted (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), pp. 5–21.

- Country of My Skull* Antje Krog, *Country of My Skull: Guilt, Sorrow, and the Limits of Forgiveness in the New South Africa* (Parktown, SA, 1998; New York: Times Books, 1999). Page citations from the South African edition.
- “Cultivating deliberating” David J. Smigelskis, “Cultivating deliberating: mindfully resourceful innovation in and through the *Federalist Papers*,” in *A Companion to Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism*, ed. Walter Jost and Wendy Olmsted (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), pp. 190–205.
- Emperor of Men’s Minds* Wayne A. Rebhorn, *The Emperor of Men’s Minds: Literature and the Renaissance Discourse of Rhetoric* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1995).
- Ethos and Pathos* Jakob Wisse, *Ethos and Pathos from Aristotle to Cicero* (Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1989).
- Excess* Joshua Scodel, *Excess and the Mean in Early Modern English Literature* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2002), pp. 61–76.
- “Exemplifying deliberation” Wendy Olmsted, “Exemplifying deliberation: Cicero’s *De officiis* and Machiavelli’s *Prince*,” in *A Companion to Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism*, ed. Walter Jost and Wendy Olmsted (Blackwell Publishing, 2004), pp. 173–89.
- “Georgics of the mind” Stanley E. Fish, “Georgics of the mind: the experience of Bacon’s *Essays*,” in *Self-Consuming Artifacts: the Experience of Seventeenth-Century Literature* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1972), pp. 78–155.
- “Gift of counsel” A. R. Ascoli, “Machiavelli’s gift of counsel,” in *Machiavelli and the Discourse of Literature*, ed. A. R. Ascoli and V. Kahn (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1993), pp. 219–57.
- “History of the anecdote” Joel Fineman, “The history of the anecdote: fiction and fiction,” in *The New Historicism*, ed. H. Aram Veers (New York: Routledge, 1989), pp. 49–76.
- Human Condition* Hannah Arendt, *The Human Condition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1958, 2nd edn. 1998).

- Humanist as Traveler* Jonathan Haynes, *The Humanist as Traveler: George Sandys's "Relation of a Journey begun an. dom. 1610"* (Rutherford, NJ: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1986).
- "Impact" Clifford Geertz, "The impact of the concept of culture on the concept of man," in *The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays by Clifford Geertz* (New York: Basic Books, 1973), pp. 33–54.
- "Incompletely theorized agreements" Cass R. Sunstein, "Incompletely theorized agreements," *Harvard Law Review* 108 (1975), pp. 1733–72.
- "Invention, emotion" Wendy Olmsted, "Invention, emotion, and conversion in Augustine's *Confessions*," in *Rhetorical Invention and Religious Inquiry: New Perspectives* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2000), pp. 65–86.
- The Invisible Man* Ralph Ellison, *The Invisible Man* (New York: Modern Library, 1952, repr. 1994).
- "Jane Austen" Gilbert Ryle, "Jane Austen and the moralists," in *English Literature and British Philosophy*, ed. with introduction by S. P. Rosenbaum (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971), pp. 168–84.
- Law, Violence* David Cohen, *Law, Violence and Community in Classical Athens* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995).
- "Lawyers and rhetoric" Richard J. Schoeck, "Lawyers and rhetoric in sixteenth-century England," in *Renaissance Eloquence: Studies in the Theory and Practice of Renaissance Rhetoric*, ed. James Murphy (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983), pp. 274–91.
- Legal Discourse* Peter Goodrich, *Legal Discourse: Studies in Linguistics, Rhetoric and Legal Analysis* (London: Macmillan, 1987); see pp. 85–124.
- Legal System* Julius Stone, *Legal System and Lawyers' Reasonings* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1964).
- Life of Milton* Barbara K. Lewalski, *The Life of John Milton: a Critical Biography* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2000).
- Machiavelli* Eugene Garver, *Machiavelli and the History of Prudence* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987).

- Machiavellian Moment* J. G. A. Pocock, *The Machiavellian Moment: Florentine Political Thought and the Atlantic Republican Tradition* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1975).
- “Metarhetorics” James J. Murphy, “Metarhetorics of Plato, Augustine, and McLuhan: a pointing essay,” *Philosophy and Rhetoric* 4 (1971), pp. 201–14.
- Middle Ages* James J. Murphy, *Rhetoric in the Middle Ages: a History of Rhetorical Theory from Saint Augustine to the Renaissance* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1974).
- A Miracle* Lawrence Weschler, *A Miracle, a Universe: Settling Accounts with Torturers* (New York: Pantheon, 1990).
- Muses of One Mind* Wesley Trimpi, *Muses of One Mind: the Literary Analysis of Experience and its Continuity* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1983).
- “My life with rhetoric” Wayne C. Booth, “My life with rhetoric,” in *A Companion to Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism*, ed. Walter Jost and Wendy Olmsted (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), pp. 494–504.
- “New Historicism” Jean E. Howard, “The New Historicism in Renaissance Studies,” *English Literary Renaissance* 16 (1986), pp. 13–43.
- “A night in the topics” J. M. Balkin, “A night in the topics: the reason of legal rhetoric and the rhetoric of legal reason,” in *Law Stories: Narrative and Rhetoric in the Law*, ed. Peter Brooks and Paul Gewirtz (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1996), pp. 211–24, 273–5.
- “On analogical reasoning” Cass R. Sunstein, “On analogical reasoning,” *Harvard Law Review* 106 (1993), pp. 741–91.
- Overcoming Law* Richard A. Posner, *Overcoming Law* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1995).
- Partial Constitution* Cass R. Sunstein, *The Partial Constitution* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993).
- Personal Patronage* Richard P. Saller, *Personal Patronage under the Early Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982).

- “Philosophical foundations” Debora K. Shuger, “The philosophical foundations of sacred rhetoric,” *Rhetorical Invention and Religious Inquiry: New Perspectives* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2000), pp. 47–64.
- Political Liberalism* John Rawls, *Political Liberalism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993).
- “Politics of deliberation” David Cohen, “The politics of deliberation: oratory and democracy in classical Athens,” in *A Companion to Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism*, ed. Walter Jost and Wendy Olmsted (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), pp. 22–37.
- Practicing New Historicism* Catherine Gallagher and Stephen Greenblatt, *Practicing New Historicism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000).
- Reading the Law* Peter Goodrich, *Reading the Law: a Critical Introduction to Legal Method and Techniques* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1986); see pp. 168–208.
- Reconciliation through Truth* Kader Asmal, Louise Asmal, and Ronald Suresh Roberts, *Reconciliation through Truth: a Reckoning of Apartheid Criminal Governance* (Cape Town: Philips, 1996).
- Resistant Structures* Richard Strier, *Resistant Structures: Particularity, Radicalism, and Renaissance Texts* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995).
- Rethinking* James L. Kastely, *Rethinking the Rhetorical Tradition: from Plato to Postmodernism* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1997).
- Rhetorical Invention* *Rhetorical Invention and Religious Inquiry*, ed. Walter Jost and Wendy Olmsted (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2000).
- “Rhetoric and action” Marc Cogan, “Rhetoric and action in Francis Bacon,” *Philosophy and Rhetoric* 14/49 (Fall, 1981), pp. 212–33.
- “Rhetoric and religion” Wayne C. Booth, “Rhetoric and religion: are they essentially wedded?,” in *Radical Pluralism and Truth: David Tracy and the Hermeneutics of Religion*, ed. Werner G. Jeanrond and Jennifer L. Rike (New York: Crossroad, 1991), pp. 62–80.